

The Traumatic Impact of **Juveniles** Tried in **Adult Courts: Implications for** Justice and Rehabilitation

Dr. Stephanie Hunter, DSW, LMSW, Assistant Clinical Professor Kathryn McGrady, JD, M.Ed., MSW Candidate

The University of South Carolina - College of Social Work

### Learning Outcomes



Understand how trauma and brain development affect youth behavior.

Examine the legal mechanisms and systemic failures allowing youth to be tried as adults.

Explore the lived experiences of youth in adult prisons.



Identify trauma-informed, developmentally appropriate alternatives and reforms.

# **Opening Reflection**

Think back to yourself at 14 ... or maybe 15 or 16.

What were you like?

What kept you up at night?

Who did you turn to when you made a mistake?

Think about the decisions you made, the people who believed in you, and the grace you were given as you learned how to navigate the world.

# Introduction to Juvenile Court



Involvement of Jane Addams





Expansion in the 20<sup>th</sup> Century



#### The teenage brain

Prefrontal cortex

Responsible for thinking, reasoning and logic. Not fully developed.

#### Amygdala Responsible for emotions like anget happiness and sathess. Rapidly develops.

The 'feeling part' of the teenage brain develops faster than the 'thinking part' making it difficult for them to regulate emotions and follow instructions

### Children Are Not Miniature Adults

- Brain development continues into the mid-20s (prefrontal cortex).
- Children are more impulsive, reactive, and susceptible to peer pressure.
- Children process consequences differently than adults.
- Developmental immaturity affects culpability and rehabilitation potential.

## Who Ends Up Juvenile Court?





#### **Children in Foster Care**

#### **Children with** Trauma

**Children with Mental Health** Needs

Waiver Motion by State

**Judicial Waiver** 

**Direct File by State** 

**Statutory Exclusion** 

Once an Adult, Always an Adult

### How Do Children Wind Up in Adult Court?

# What Is Waiver?

Waiver is the t juvenile court to that a juvenile i trial, sentencing face harshe defendant

### Waiver is the transfer of a child from

- juvenile court to adult court. This means
- that a juvenile is treated as an adult for
- trial, sentencing, and punishment. They
  - face harsher sentences as adult
    - defendants than juveniles do.



# **Typical Waiver Timeline**

#### Charged by Law Enforcement

Formally Charged by Solicitor

Waiver Motion Filed by Solicitor

Youth is taken into custody by law enforcement.

Solicitor files charges with the Clerk of Court's Family Court Division

Solicitor decide if the case is serious enough tor the youth to be waived up.



#### Interviews and Discovery

#### Waiver Hearing

Information gathering by both sides & the exchange of evidence by state.

The waiver hearing is set and it's treated as a trial-like process with the judge making the decision.

### **Recent Supreme Court Decisions**

#### Roper v. Simmons (2005)

No Death Penalty for Juveniles. Graham v. Florida (2010) No Life without Parole (LWOP) for Juveniles for non-homicide crimes.

#### Miller v. Alabama (2012)

No Mandatory Life without Parole (LWOP).

# What Should Matter Most?

"When deciding how to respond to a juvenile who has committed a serious offense, which of the following should weigh most heavily?"

# Poll& Prioritize



#### What Should Matter Most?

Developmental Capcacity

Public Safety

Trauma History

Victim's Perspective

Racial Equity

Potential of Rehabilitation

• Loading...



# What Should Matter Most?

Why Did You **Choose Your Answer?** 





**How Do Trauma** and Adolescent **Brain Development** Affect These **Priorities?** 



#### What Surprised You About the Poll Results?

#### How Would Your Role as a **Social Worker Influence** How You'd Respond to a Youth Facing Transfer to Adult Court?



Identity Formation Becomes Survival Mode Erikson Meets the Legal System

Cognitive and Emotional Growth is Undermined

Social Development is Distorted

Educational and Vocational Pathways are Disrupted

## **Adolescent Development** in Adult Prison: **A Stunted Trajectory**

# Why Does This Matter?



Both are involved in similar crimes but tried in different courts.

#### Both experience different life outcomes.

#### Jordan and Malik are both 15 years old living in different counties.

# What Might Jordan's Life Look Like in Adult **Prison?**

**Exposure to Extreme Violence and Fear** 

**Developmental Stagnation and Mental Health Decline** 

Lack of Access to Age-Appropriate Programming

Permanent Adult Records and Reentry Barriers

**Regret and Missed Opportunities.** 



# **National Statistics**

At the turn of the 21st century, it was estimated that 250,000 children every year were charged as adults in the United States.

> By 2019, that number had dropped 80% to 53,000.



# Statewide Statistics



#### Table 1: State Counts of Youth Under Age 18 in Jails Mid-Year (2019)

State	
Alabama	
Arizona	
Arkansas	
Florida	
Georgia*	
Illinois	
Indiana	
Iowa	
Kansas	
Louisiana*	
Maryland	
Michigan*	
Minnesota	1
Mississippi*	
Missouri*	
Montana	1
Nebraska	
Nevada	
New Mexico	
New York*	
North Carolina*	
Ohio	
Oklahoma	
Pennsylvania	
South Carolina*	
South Dakota	
Tennessee	
Texas*	
Utah	
Virginia	
Washington	
Wisconsin*	
Wyoming	

Count	
24	
136	
69	
296	
192	
1	
62	
34	
19	
129	
76	
93	
5	
84	
45	
18	
5	
26	
19	
106	
307	
24	
32	
89	
96	
7	
39	
299	
2	
12	
5	
48	
15	

#### Table 2: State & Federal Counts of Youth Under Age 18 in Adult Prisons (2019)

State	Count
Alabama	2
Alaska	5
Arizona	55
Arkansas	8
Colorado	7
Connecticut	52
Delaware	5
Federal	27
Florida	81
Georgia*	31
Indiana	31
Louisiana	18
Maryland	16
Michigan*	26
Minnesota	4
Mississippi	21
Missouri	4
Nebraska	7
Nevada	11
New York*	36
North Carolina*	61
Chie	36
Oklahoma	9
Pennsylvania	9
South Carolina*	23
Tennessee	9
Texas*	38
Utah	3
Vermont	1
Virginia	12
Washington	5

# "Raise the Age" Campaign



Enacted through the SC Legislature in 2016
Effective July 1, 2019, this law increased the age at which individuals are *automatically* tried as adults from 17 to 18 years old
Aims to reduce recidivism and promote better long-term outcomes for youth.

# **Alternatives to Prison**



#### Community-Based Diversion

#### Specialized Residential Alternative Placement

- caring for his two siblings, ages 7 and 10.
- were arrested.

• Jalen is a 15-year-old Black youth living in a rural area of South Carolina. His mom works two jobs and struggles to afford rent, food, and childcare. Jalen has been suspended twice this year for fighting. What school staff don't know is that he's been acting out after witnessing domestic violence and losing a cousin to gun violence. Jalen is also responsible for

 Last week, Jalen was caught breaking into a convenience store late at night with two older teens. No one was hurt, but police were called, and all three

Turning Point #1: Charging Decision
What should happen next?
A. Jalen is charged in juvenile court and assessed for diversion or intervention.
B. Jalen is waived to adult court because of the felony-level property offense.
C. Jalen is referred to a restorative justice program in the community.

Turning Point #2: Detention or Not?
What placement makes the most sense while Jalen awaits his hearing?
A. Held in juvenile detention "for safety."
B. Released to parental custody with support services.
C. Connected to a mentorship or community-based wraparound program.





Jalen's healing and growth? A. Restorative justice circle with the store owner and family. **B. Expulsion and probation.** and counseling.

- Turning Point #3: Accountability Approach What kind of intervention would support
- C. Specialized juvenile treatment court
- focused on trauma, school reengagement,

# **Closing Remarks**

Which options reflected a trauma-informed, developmentally appropriate approach?

How would you feel if Jalen were your child? What would you hope the system would do?

What systemic barriers showed up in this story?

What can social workers, advocates, or policymakers do differently?



## **Questions, Comments, Reflections**

#### Stephanie Hunter: sghunter@mailbox.sc.edu Kathryn McGrady: mcgradyk@email.sc.edu



"Court is recessed until the big hand is on the three."

## References:

Cavanagh, C., Orr, C., Kitzmiller, M. K., Martinez, R., Villarruel, F., & Mistrett, M. (2024). Understanding the lived experiences of youth incarcerated in adult facilities through their letters: A content analysis. Punishment & Society, 26(5), 813–839. https://doi.org/10.1177/14624745231220319

Children's Law Center. (2023). Quick reference guide to juvenile court in South Carolina: An overview of juvenile delinquency proceedings & related issues for family court judges and attorneys (2023 ed.). Joseph F. Rice School of Law, University of South Carolina. <u>http://childlaw.sc.edu</u>

Puzone, K. I. (2023). Juvenile court exists for a reason: An argument in support of recognizing a constitutional right for those under the age of majority to be tried in juvenile court. Stanford Journal of Civil Rights & Civil Liberties, 19(2), 157–188.

Riggs Romaine, C. L., Goldstein, N. E. S., Hunt, E., & DeMatteo, D. (2011). Traumatic experiences and juvenile amenability: The role of trauma in forensic evaluations and judicial decision making. Child & Youth Care Forum, 40(5), 363–380. <u>https://doi.org/10.1007/s10566-010-9132-4</u>

Schubert, C. A., Mulvey, E. P., Loughran, T. A., & Losoya, S. H. (2010). Criminal careers and juvenile offending: Predicting futures for transferred youth. Law and Human Behavior, 34(6), 460–473. <u>https://doi.org/10.1007/s10979-009-9191-z</u>

The Sentencing Project. (2022). Youth in adult courts, jails, and prisons. <u>https://www.sentencingproject.org/app/uploads/2022/09/Youth-in-</u> <u>Adult-Courts-Jails-and-Prisons.pdf</u>